

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION Action Minutes

Wednesday, February 7, 2024

Regular Meeting
Commencing at 6:30 p.m.
Hybrid Meeting – City Hall Wing and Virtually –

Wing Rooms 118, 119 & 120

200 East Santa Clara Street San José, CA 95113

https://sanjoseca.zoom.us/j/83676017189

Commission Members

Paul Boehm, Chair Rachel Royer, Vice Chair Harriett Arnold Lawrence Camuso Sara Ghalandari Edward Janke

Christopher Burton, Director Department of Planning, Building & Code Enforcement

Access the video, agenda, and related reports for this meeting by visiting the City's website at:

https://www.sanjoseca.gov/your-government/departments/planning-building-code-enforcement/planning-division/commissions-and-hearings/historic-landmarks-commission

Page 1 of 10 Last Revised: 2/28/2024

AGENDA

ORDER OF BUSINESS

WELCOME

Meeting called to order at 6:30 p.m. Chairman Boehm welcomed new Commissioner Sara Ghalandari.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Commissioners Boehm, Royer, Camuso, Ghalandari, Janke

ABSENT: Commissioner Arnold **RESIGNED:** Commissioner Ayala

1. **DEFERRALS**

No Items

CONSENT CALENDAR 2.

No Items

3. PUBLIC HEARINGS

No Items

4. PLANNING REFERRALS

No Items

GENERAL BUSINESS 5.

a. St. James Park Capital Vision and Performing Arts Pavilion Project.

PROJECT MANAGER, HAN-LEI WANG

Recommendation: Review and comment on the 65% design development for the St. James Park Capital Vision and Levitt Pavilion Project in accordance with Condition 12 of Historic Preservation Permit File No. HP19-008.

Chairman Boehm introduced the item.

Han-Lei Wang, Project Manager, presented an overview of the 65% Design Review project progress. She stated the layout of the project has remained roughly the same, while design details such as materials choices have progressed since earlier review of the project at 25% Design. Ms. Wang discussed conditions of approval for the Historic Preservation Permit, especially Condition 12 which requires Historic Landmarks Commission review at 25% and 65% completion of design.

Chairman Boehm called for Commissioner questions.

Commissioner Janke indicated the layout is similar to medieval forts and asked about the underlying concept of the design. Ms. Wang responded that the changes since 25% Design review were mostly related to construction details including how things fit together, dimensions and materials.

Commissioner Camuso expressed concern about the design in relation to the surrounding historic buildings, noise mitigation for the events planned in the park, and sanitation.

Vice Chairman Royer inquired about materials changes since the earlier review. Ms. Wang said there have been few changes, and materials overall such as surfacing in the dog park and playground have remained the same.

In response to earlier Commissioner comments about the design, Ms. Wang stated that the design was part of a competition and the concept transitions from the Monument Walk on the outside portion of the park to modern design in the center which accommodates the need to activate the center of the park.

Vice Chairman Royer inquired about noise mitigation measures for events in the park. Ms. Wang responded that an audio engineer was involved in the design of the pavilion. She stated that the sound is meant to travel to the center of the park to avoid passing beyond the borders of the park.

Chairman Boehm clarified for the public that most of the current Commissioners were not on the Commission at the time the application for the Historic Preservation Permit t was reviewed. He asked about the status of signs and markers in the park as part of Condition 11 of Historic Preservation Permit HP19-008. Ms. Wang responded the design of the signs and markers, as well as the fountain were not yet prepared, but they would be working with Historic Preservation Officer Dana Peak and would bring them before Historic Landmarks Commission review in the future. Chairman Boehm suggested signs and markers could relate to the history of bull and bear fights commonly practiced in that part of San José, as well as the park's history as a parade ground during the Civil War years in the 1860s.

Commissioner Janke commented the design was similar to Tivoli Park or other theme parks. He expressed concern over the number of elements in the design and the inquired about the possibility of retaining the existing fountain.

Chairman Boehm suggested renaming the Monument Path to something like History Trail or History Lane to emphasize the overall history of the park, rather than the few monuments in the park. He inquired if the trees specified on the plan are cedar or redwood trees. Chairman Boehm commented that he would prefer native redwood trees. Ms. Wang responded that suggestion would be passed along to the consultants. Chairman Boehm inquired about the number of parking spaces in the park. Ms. Wang responded that parking spaces are along the street, but there are no parking spaces within the park design.

Commissioner Ghalandari inquired how much change could still be made to the project and if the project has funding? Ms. Wang responded that there could be changes in materials due to budget, but there would be an effort to stay with the competition-winning design the extent possible.

Chairman Boehm called for public comment.

Mike Sodergren of PAC*SJ commented about the context around the park and how it might shape the design inside the park. He commented that PAC*SJ would like to preserve the granite edges and other features, but they recognize the need for activation of the park.

Chairman Boehm closed public comment.

Commissioner Camuso asked where the unhoused people who currently stay in the park would go. Ms. Wang responded that activation would encourage unhoused to seek other places to stay, perhaps as part of the mayoral initiative to create affordable housing.

Chairman Boehm summarized the reservations of the Commission, commenting that many of the Commissioners feel the design could be improved. He emphasized the importance of adding more history to the park and thanked Ms. Wang for the presentation.

Commissioner comments were received, no action was taken.

b. Five Wounds Historic Resources Survey.

PROJECT MANAGER, DANA PEAK EDWARDS

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission receive the Five Wounds Historic Resources Survey project presentation from Garavaglia Architecture Inc. and review and comment on the draft survey report and supporting documentation.

Chairman Boehm introduced the item and Project Manager, Dana Peak Edwards welcomed the project consultants and presenters – Garavaglia Architecture, Inc.

The Garavaglia Architecture, Inc team, Mike Garavaglia, Kathleen McDonald and Joseph van den Berg, presented an overview, findings and recommendations for the Five Wounds Urban Villages Historic Resources Survey project.

Chairman Boehm called for Commissioner questions.

Chairman Boehm inquired how many DPR 523 forms were completed for the project. The consultant responded 31 forms were completed.

Chairman Boehm called for public comment.

Ben Leech, PAC*SJ commented on the importance of surveys done in conjunction with urban village planning. He expressed concern about the level of completion of the project, and how the information might be used to streamline development. Mr. Leech expressed concern about inconsistencies in the reports between buildings that look similar but are treated differently as historic resources or left off the proposed listing on the Historic Resources Inventory.

Chairman Boehm responded that he noticed that many buildings had not been rated as "historic" or the DPR forms seemed incomplete.

Lilian Koenig commented that the new City policy to prevent phone and zoom comments was unnerving because she is unable to attend many of the meetings in person. She also

expressed concern about the difficulty of the public to determine what is historic and what is not historic if the Commission is also confused about how the determination is made.

Chairman Boehm responded there are a number of criterion used to determine what is historic or not, and association with significant people or events is often used to determine a property's historic significance and classification.

Vice Chairman Royer inquired about next steps for the project and whether the final draft would come before the Commission again.

Ms. Peak Edwards responded she would work with the consultant to incorporate comments received into the final draft, but that the documents would then be finalized and not brought before the Commission again.

Chairman Boehm thanked the consultant for their work and closed out the item.

No action was taken.

c. Modifications to the San José Historic Resource Inventory.

PROJECT MANAGER, DANA PEAK EDWARDS

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission add the following properties to the Historic Resources Inventory:

Eligible for National Register (ENR), Eligible California Register (ECR) and Candidate City Landmark (CCL)

- 1. 1568 Liberty Street (APN 015-03-042)
- 2. 1621 Gold Street (015-03-017)

Eligible for Eligible California Register (ECR) and Candidate City Landmark (CCL)

3. 1557 Michigan Avenue (APN 015-06-143)

Candidate City Landmark (CCL)

4. 900 South 2nd Street (APN 472-16-039) Deferred from 11/01/2023

Structure of Merit (SM)

- 5. 1590 Gold Street (APN 015-03-043)
- 6. 1392 Michigan Avenue (APN 015-05-066)
- 7. 5030 North 1st Street (APN 015-43-012)

Identified Structure (IS)

- 8. 98 North 17th Street (APN 467-13-005)
- 9. 272 North 8th Street (APN 467-02-108)
- 10. 1181 Catherine Street (APN 015-02-039)
- 11. 1410 Liberty Street (APN 015-02-040)
- 12. 1269 State Street (APN 015-12-019)
- 13. 1065 Elizabeth Street (APN 015-03-046)
- 14. 1407 Wabash Street (APN 015-06-031)
- 15. 1513 Gold Street (APN 015-03-043)

- 16. 1259 State Street (APN 015-12-018)
- 17. 1132 North Taylor Street (APN 015-02-020)
- 18. 1020 North Taylor Street (APN 015-02-024)
- 19. 5220 North 1st Street (APN 015-03-032)
- 20. 5210 North 1st Street (APN 015-03-034)
- 21. 1113 Taylor Street (APN 015-03-036)
- 22. 5168 North 1st Street (APN 015-43-014)
- 23. 5004 North 1st Street (APN 015-39-040, 015-39-041)
- 24. 1280 Wabash Street (APN 015-12-068)
- 25. 1592 Grand Boulevard (APN 015-06-140)
- 26. 1391 Wabash Street (APN 015-05-022)

Chairman Boehm introduced the item.

Project Manager Dana Peak Edwards gave a brief overview of the item which includes properties eligible for listing on the Historic Resources Inventory – those identified in the Alviso Historic Context and Survey, properties suggested by members of the public and 900 South 2nd Street which was deferred from action at the November 2023 meeting. Staff recommended the addition of all properties listed to the Historic Resources Inventory with the exception of 98 North 17th Street which was recommended for deferral to a later Historic Landmarks Commission meeting because new information had come to light from the public that was not included in the Five Wounds Historic Resources Survey documentation.

Chairman Boehm inquired if properties already listed on the Historic Resources Inventory would be left off the list of recommended additions. Ms. Peak Edwards responded that is correct and the classification of previously listed properties would be changed on the staff level because no new requirements would be imposed as a result.

Chairman Boehm called for public comment.

Ward Lopes commented as the owner of 98 North 17th Street. He requested deferral of the item to allow him more time to learn about the effects of listing on the Historic Resources Inventory. Mr. Lopes commented that he would like to learn more about the process but did not have time prior to the meeting to become familiar with what it would mean to be listed on the Historic Resources Inventory.

Mohit Garg commented on 1280 Wabash Street, which is currently being used as a church. He commented that the church is a small 125-member religious body which participates in food bank drives and river cleanup, and they use the property mainly on weekends for religious assembly. Mr. Garg commented that the church was surprised to learn the property was proposed to be added to the Historic Resources Inventory. He inquired about the classification, what restrictions would be placed on the property, and how the proposed listing would affect their insurance or the ability to make modifications to the property like adding a canopy, solar panels or conducting standard maintenance? Mr. Gage inquired about the impact the listing might have should a seismic event occur and the church needs to address damage, and would there be any impact if the church decided to sell the property? He requested more information about the advantages and disadvantages of listing on the Historic Resources Inventory.

Chairman Boehm responded with assurances that more information would be shared with the owners of the property, and he acknowledged their request to defer consideration of listing the properties on the Historic Resources Inventory.

Sridhar Kotti commented as part of the church on 1280 Wabash Street. He commented that the church purchased the property partly based on the modern residential building on the property and not the historic aspect of the property. Mr. Kotti expressed concern that the property would be flagged for insurance purposes or that it would be difficult to do work on the property. He raised the issue of landscaping, and whether the listing would change the value of the property.

Prashant Talwar submitted a speaker card but deferred his time to another member of the congregation who was unable to attend in person and was online to comment.

Ben Leech of PAC*SJ appreciated the proposed addition of properties to the Historic Resources Inventory. He commented that he understood the community interest and wanted to assuage the fears of property owners about the burdens of being listed on the Historic Resources Inventory. Mr. Leech commented that the Alviso survey is a good example of selecting character-defining buildings but not excluding everything else. He noted that using representative building types is a good methodology for limited resources. Mr. Leech commented that because the historic context statement is a public document, PAC*SJ and the Silicon Valley Bicycle Coalition are using the context statement to plan the route of an Alviso bicycle tour this weekend.

Mike Sodergren of PAC*SJ commented that it is encouraging when people are using buildings which are historic, understanding they will often need some updates, and generally expressing support of partnerships to keep historic structures in use.

Chairman Boehm responded in agreement that the Commission is happy to see ongoing and adaptive reuse of buildings on the Historic Resources Inventory.

Dayal Nagasuru commented online on 1280 Wabash Street. He commented that the public notification postcard received in the mail about the proposed listing was unclear whether there is documentation available (such as DPR 523 forms) for the property as part of a study because the information was not readily available on the website. Mr. Nagasuru requested more information about the proposed listing.

Chairman Boehm responded that DPR 523 forms are not completed for "Identified Structures." He commented that proposed designations like City Landmarks require professional documentation.

Ms. Peak Edwards responded formal documentation was not completed for the property as an Identified Structure and that the proposed listing would serve as a potential historic resource flag for the property when redevelopment is proposed.

Chairman Boehm closed public comment and called for Commissioners comment.

Commissioner Camuso commented on 89 North 17th Street and commended the ornamentation of the building. He commented that he remembered when the house was moved to its current location and noted that the property and paint job is lovely, and the house complements the neighborhood.

Chairman Boehm also commented positively on 98 North 17th treet and noted that if the property owner was interested, the property might be eligible for City Landmark designation. He reassured the property owner that City Landmark designation was not on the agenda for consideration and acknowledged the request for deferral.

Chairman Boehm read a statement to be placed in the public record, as follows:

Placing properties on the Historic Resources Index is useful for two reasons: it provides some protections to properties that otherwise could be altered or partial removals without a building permit. It also helps property owners realize the worth of their homes to the community. Although the private property owners retain the rights to alter their homes, having a home on the HRI would raise their awareness of the community's loss, and may dissuade some from making major alterations or removals. Some property owners may be inspired to seek a landmark designation. That we have seen a steady increase in the properties added to the HRI is something that the community can celebrate. Historic means Community in many ways. So many local cities have beautiful downtowns (Los Gatos, Palo Alto, Mountain View) so that we know that history means community, culture, and beauty. Many thanks to the community members who allow or encourage these additions. In particular, great thanks to PAC SJ as they have recommended many properties to be added. A huge round of applause for the City's Building, Planning, and Code Enforcement Department and Dana Peak Edwards in particular for promoting our history, our community, and our culture by adding properties to the HRI! One hundred forty-four (144) properties have been added to the HRI in 2023!

Chairman Boehm closed Commissioner comment.

Vice Chairman Royer made a motion to defer consideration of 98 North 17th Street and 1280 Wabash Street for listing on the Historic Resources Inventory to April 3, 2024, and to approve the remainder of the properties for listing on the Historic Resources Inventory. Commissioner Camuso seconded the motion.

The Commission voted 5-0-1 (Commissioner Arnold absent) to approve the motion.

d. 2024 Santa Clara County Preservation Alliance Awards Night

Recommendation: Accept status report from the Historic Preservation Month/Preservation Awards Night Standing Committee.

Chairman Boehm gave an update on the Preservation Awards Night Advisory Group meeting. He stated that the Advisory Group was made up of members: Franklin Maggi of Archives and Architecture, Architectural Historian Krista Van Laan, Pac SJ Executive Director Ben Leech, Ramon Martinez who is Associate Professor of Education at Stanford University, and Commission subcommitee members Larry Camuso, Ed Janke and Paul Boehm. Chairman Boehm reported that he chaired the Advisory Group meeting.

He reported that the group discussed the criteria for evaluating properties and considered specific properties for an award including Fairglen Additions for its listing on the National Register of Historic Places. Chairman Boehm reported that the group will meet again on March 20, 2024, to determine which properties will be recommended for an award to the Historic Landmarks Commission at the April 3rd meeting.

6. REFERRALS FROM CITY COUNCIL, BOARDS, COMMISSIONS, OR OTHER AGENCIES

No Items

7. **OPEN FORUM**

Members of the public are invited to speak on any item that does not appear on today's Agenda and that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission. The Commission cannot engage in any substantive discussion or take any formal action in response to the public comment. The Commission can only ask questions or respond to statements to the extent necessary to determine whether to: (1) refer the matter to staff for follow-up; (2) request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting; or (3) direct staff to place the item on a future agenda. Each member of the public may fill out a speaker's card and has up to two minutes to address the Commission. If you have joined by teleconference and wish to speak on one of these items, please use the 'raise hand' feature in Zoom or press *9 from a touch tone phone to raise a hand to speak.

Mike Sodergren, PAC*SJ, requested that the Commission set a meeting or authorize a subcommittee to review and provide comment on the draft EIR for O Seeley Avenue within the public circulation period with attention to the on-site relocation alternatives, in particular alternatives 4 and 5. He asked about the status of the "demolition by neglect" ordinance previously proposed by the Commission, expressed concern about Burbank Theatre, the First Church of Christ Scientist, and other neglected buildings in the city. Mr. Sodergren commented that PAC*SJ did a political candidate survey which would be sent to the Commission as a link via email that includes responses on issues related to historic preservation from the political candidates running for office. He noted that in the past the webpage has been useful to determine candidate priorities. Mr. Sodergren expressed concern about the recent policy to remove public comment over zoom and telephone, especially for smaller City commissions, because it can be difficult to attend meetings that are scheduled concurrently.

Chairman Boehm inquired whether the draft EIR for O Seeley Avenue could be brought back to the Commission for discussion. Dana Peak Edwards responded that would not be possible because public comment period closes on March 2nd and it was not placed on the agenda because the Commission already reviewed the project alternatives and provided comments. Chairman Boehm commented that in the past he has written comment letters to support a position, but no changes resulted from the letters. He commented that the Commission input previously provided would have to stand, but he encouraged the newer members of the Commission who were not present for the review of the O Seeley Avenue project alternatives to consider writing comments and making their views known.

Chairman Boehm inquired whether the Burbank Theatre could be protected. Ms. Peak Edwards responded that the building is located in unincorporated county and is outside of the jurisdiction of the City of San José.

Chairman Boehm passed along a comment received on Old Almaden Winery, to fence and protect the winery.

8. GOOD AND WELFARE

a. Report from Secretary, Planning Commission, and City Council

- i. Verbal update on the status of Planning approvals by the City Council, Planning Commission and Planning Director of projects with a historic resource component. No updates.
- ii. Summary of communications received by the Historic Landmarks Commission. An email from PAC*SJ dated on February 1st to all Commissioners was received about the Burbank Theater.
- iii. Verbal update on Alviso StoryMap.

Ms. Peak Edwards updated the Commission on the status of the project. The Alviso Historic Context survey was completed and the next step is to create a StoryMap based on the historic context statement. The City is working on migrating the StoryMap data and photos to the City's website and once completed, the link will be shared.

iv. Next Meeting is March 6, 2024, in San Jose City Hall, Wing Rooms 118, 119, 120.

b. Report from Committees

i. Design Review Subcommittee: No meeting was held on December 21, 2023. The next meeting is scheduled for Thursday, February 15, 2024 at 11:00 a.m.

c. Approval of Action Minutes

i. **Recommendation:** Approval of Action Minutes for the Historic Landmarks Commission Meeting of December 6, 2023.

Chairman Boehm corrected the spelling of the name of Thomas Fun under item 5.a. of the December 2023 Action Minutes to Thomas Foon Chew. There were no additional changes made to the minutes.

d. Status of Circulating Environmental Documents

i. O Seeley Avenue Mixed Use Project Draft Environmental Impact Report https://www.sanjoseca.gov/Home/Components/News/News/5662/4699

ADJOURNMENT

Meeting adjourned at 8:36 p.m.