



Redistricting Commission City of San José MINUTES

<https://sanjoseca.zoom.us/j/92742607814>

6:00 PM

Wednesday, November 17, 2021

Present: Sylvia Alvarez (6:05 p.m.), Dee Barragan, Jonathan Bruns (6:20 p.m.), Fred Buzo, Enedina Cardenas, Gloria Collins, Andrew Ditlevsen, B J Fadem, Ramon Martinez (6:37 p.m.), Freddie W. Sidbury Jr., Lenka Wright

Absent: None

Staff: Megan Roche, Legislative Secretary; Toni J. Taber, City Clerk; Mark Vanni, Senior Deputy City Attorney; Jacob Thompson-Fisher, Redistricting Partners

I. Call to Order & Orders of the Day

The meeting was called to order at 6:02 p.m.

II. Action Items

a. Final Recommendations on City of San Jose Council District Maps

Jeffrey Buchanan presented the final updates made to the Unity Map (revised 11/14/2021). Cheryl Lubow and Sonya Lu presented updates to the Community Map (revised 11/14/2021, titled Community Map 5.0).

Public Comment: Ingrid Mult supported the Unity Map because she believes in equal voting rights and equal opportunities for all. Paul Soto asked for a map of redlining in San José to be centered. Carlos Barba, Vice President of the Washington Guadalupe Neighborhood Association, asked that the Guadalupe Washington, Tamien, and Goodyear Mastic neighborhood be kept unified in District 3. Call-In User_1 discussed power dynamics with regard to redistricting and did not believe redistricting is necessary. Jill Borders asked how the shapes of Districts 2 and 10 within the Unity Map were determined. Bien Doan stated that the Unity Map does not represent the Vietnamese community and expressed support for the Community Map. Nathan Ulsh, Director of Policy and Operations at the San José Downtown Association, asked the commissioners to keep the Downtown and PBID districts intact and supported the Community Map 5.0. Ted Earle, President of Thousand Oaks Neighborhood Association, supported the Community Map because it adheres most closely to the current district lines and has the lowest overall demographic changes per district. Wolfram Schneider urged the Commission to support the Community Map 5.0 and keep Downtown together. Doris Livezey supported the Community Map because it represents the population and demographics of San José. Sandra D. supported the Community Map because it moves the least number of people. Spencer Horowitz urged the Commission to adopt the

Community Map because it moves the least number of people into new districts and is fair. Misrayn Mendoza supported the Unity Map because it protects his community. Ryan Jones supported the Unity Map because it keeps and brings communities and neighborhoods together. A caller with the name "WW" supported the Community Map and strongly opposed the Unity and D4 Maps. David Bini, Executive Director of the Santa Clara and San Benito Counties' Building and Construction Trades Council, strongly supported the Unity Map because it would unravel the gerrymandering of earlier generations and rebalance Council districts for better representation. A caller with the phone number ending in 0319 expressed support for the Community Map. Melissa Got-Lopez, President of the Mount Pleasant Neighborhood Association, thanked the City Clerk and Commissioners for their work and looked forward to the three maps being brought forth to City Council. Kimi supported the Community Map because it keeps her community together and opposed the Unity Map. John Hesler strongly supported the Community Map because it moves the least number of people and he did not support the Unity Map. Tod Williams discussed the goals of the Unity Map and the lack of modifications made after community input was received. Nancy supported the Community Map because it legally achieves the goal of keeping communities together, especially communities in District 3. Hector Moreno supported the Unity Map and did not support the Community Map because it would reduce the voice of Latinx, Black, and Asian voters while increasing the voice of White homeowners. Marissa G supported the Community Map and stated that Downtown needs to stay intact. Forest Peterson, researcher at Stanford University, supported the Unity Map because of the legacy of redlining in the area. Yuritza Martinez supported the Unity Map to allow for all communities to have an equal voice. Mullissa Willette supported the Unity Map because it has the lowest deviation of all maps, promotes equal representation, and conforms to legal requirements. Suzanne Morrone supported the Community Map because it does not break up communities. Anh Doan supported the Community Map because it is fair and follows guidelines. Roma Dawson supported the Unity Map because it promotes the most equity. Edmundo Escarcega spoke in favor of the Unity Map because it promotes fairness and ensures that ethnic coalitions have an equal vote. Jenny Zhao supported the Community Map and did not support the D4 or Unity Maps. Ha Tran urged the Commission to reject the Unity Map because it is unfairly distributed and has political motives. Jonathan Karpf discussed redlining in San José and supported the Unity Map because it keeps neighborhoods whole, promotes fairness, and promotes equity. Jose Luis Pavon, Political Organizer for SEIUUSWW, supported the Unity Map because it would enfranchise the traditionally disenfranchised communities in San José. Tobin Gilman, Board Member of the District 10 Leadership Coalition and President of the Graystone Park Neighborhood Association, urged the Commission to support the Community Map and did not support the Unity Map. Richard urged the Commission to support the Community Map because it supports and protects communities. Araceli Rueda strongly supported the Unity Map because it ensures proper representation regardless of economic status or background. Rita Birrueta supported the Unity Map to avoid division in the community and wished for Valley Palms to remain in District 7. Jen supported the Community Map and did not support the Unity or D4 Maps. Bob Jamello, Co-Vice President of Thousand Oaks Neighborhood Association, supported the Community Map 5.0 because it accomplishes adjustments with the least disruption to communities.

Rosalinda Aguilar, President of the Guadalupe Washington Neighborhood Association, asked the Commission to keep the Guadalupe Washington, Tamien, and Goodyear Mastic neighborhoods united in District 3. Blair Beekman discussed East-West ideas and the inclusion of the Willow Road area within District 7. Maristella Tapia supported the Unity Map because it is democratic, it has the least amount of voter suppression, and it provides adequate representation to the Latinx, Asian, and Black populations. Zin Htwe supported the Unity Map because of existing divisions, the wealth gap, and imbalances within regions of San José. Tim Clauson, President of the Vendome Neighborhood Association, asked the Commission to keep the Vendome neighborhood within District 3, supported the Community Map 5.0, and asked that the Unity Map not be forwarded to City Council. David Noel did not support the Unity Map and urged the Commission to recommend the Community Map to City Council because it preserves communities of interest and keeps districts compact contiguous and manageable. Kathy Tran supported the Unity Map because it is a chance to right the wrongs of redlining and promote a fairer map. John Turner, President of the Naglee Park Campus Community Organization, supported the Community Map and rejected the Unity Map. Timothy He, Vice President of the Evergreen Chinese American Association, supported the Community Map. Nancy Avila, President of the Vietnamese American Chamber of Commerce, supported the Community Map in efforts to stop hate, racism, and division in San José. Brenda Dohmen, board member of the District 10 Leadership Coalition, supported the Community Map 5.0 because it is not a political special interest map. Ben Vo strongly supported the Unity Map because it keeps neighborhoods whole and strengthens the voice of the Vietnamese community. Sujuan strongly supported the Community Map and opposed special interests trying to divide San José. Laura Watkins opposed the Unity Map's placement of the Cory neighborhood in District 1. Thien supported the Community Map and did not feel represented by the Unity Map. Andrew Macias requested that the Commission forward the Unity Map to City Council because it would address extreme inequality and it treats the East Side of San José with respect. Betsy Hammer Carr supported the Unity Map because of San José's history of redlining which largely coincides with the current district lines. Antonina supported the Community Map because it keeps neighborhoods that are working together intact. H.G. Nguyen supported the Community Map and noted the lack of Asian representation on the City Council. Gabriela Garzon Gupta supported the Unity Map to address inequalities and give power back in San José. Krista De La Torre supported the Unity Map to keep communities together and ensure that every single San Jose resident has a fair say in their representation. Maria Rocha supported the Unity Map because it ensures that resident voices are not diluted or split among competing neighborhoods. Erica Paul, member of Local 393, urged the Commission to support the Unity Map to override past redlining and provide equity in San José communities. Bao Dang strongly supported the Community Map and opposed the Unity Map. Marni Kamzan strongly supported the Community Map because it keeps communities together and each district retains the same ethnic majority that it previously had. Keith Young strongly supported the Community Map because it achieves the goal of balancing populations. Debra Spencer supported the Community Map and did not wish for the Unity Map to be forwarded to City Council. Jeffrey Buchanan, trustee of the Luther Burbank School District, discussed how the Community and D4 Maps reinforce historical inequities. Lupe stated that the Unity Map

is politically driven and that her community does not benefit from it. Stephanie did not support the Unity Map due to the placement of the Vendome neighborhood and wished that it not be considered by the Commission. Wade noted that the Unity Map appeared gerrymandered and preferred the Community Map which was created from the ground up. Sherri supported the Community Map because of the lack of political motivation behind its creation. Nhat Doan believed that the Unity Map divides communities and supported the Community Map because it is fair and follows redistricting guidelines. Steve Cohen supported the Unity Map because of the current lack of representation for the Vietnamese and Asian communities. Hector Moreno supported the Unity Map and wished for East San José to be kept together. Andres Quintero discussed the motivations of map supporters who label themselves as “real community members.” José Villareal, Vice Chair of the Parks and Recreation Commission, stated that the Unity Map intends to uplift the voices of communities of color and it is supported by community-based organizations and civil rights leaders. Elizabeth Mattson strongly supported the Community Map and noted that the Unity Map addresses a single agenda item at a single point in time instead of taking community efforts over the past years into consideration. Jennifer Liu supported the Community Map and did not support the D4 or Unity Maps because of their divisiveness. Camila Martinez supported the Unity Map to create a fair future for the youth. Annelise Vaudagna spoke in support of the Community Map because it is for democracy, not demographics. Dan Pan strongly supported the Community Map because it achieves better Asian representation. Mary Bitter strongly supported the Community Map for recommendation to the City Council. Dac Doan did not support the D4 or Unity Maps and supported the Community Map because it is fair and follows redistricting guidelines. Mary Helen Doherty stated that the revised Unity Map is the best option to ensure an equal voice for every San Jose resident. Van Le urged the Commissioners to recommend the Unity Map because the other maps under consideration will reduce the voices of Asian, Black, and Latinx residents. Raymond Li strongly opposed the Unity and D4 maps because they are unfair and divisive and strongly supported the Community Map. Tomara Hall supported the Unity Map to maintain representation for disenfranchised communities. Jen Myhre, Community Organizer with Sacred Heart Community Service, supported the Unity Map because it promotes fairness, ensures that ethnic coalitions have an equal vote in their district, and conforms to both the Fair Maps Act and the California Voting Rights Act.

Action: Commissioner Barragan proposed a motion, which was seconded by Commissioner Alvarez, to recommend that the Guadalupe Washington, Goodyear Mastic, Tamien, and Spartan Keyes neighborhoods be kept in the same district. After discussion amongst commissioners ensued, Commissioner Barragan agreed to table her motion.

Action: Commissioner Ditlevsen proposed a motion to advance the Commission Map (Map D4) to City Council for their consideration. This motion was seconded by Commissioner Wright.

Jacob Thompson-Fisher, on behalf of Redistricting Partners, presented and compared draft map plans D4 (the Commission Map), the Unity Map (revised 11/14/2021), and

Community Map 5.0 with current district lines. Discussion amongst commissioners ensued. Commissioner Barragan proposed a friendly amendment to Commissioner Ditlevsen's motion, to recommend the advancement of the Commission's D4 Map, with the recommendation that the Guadalupe Washington, Goodyear Mastic, Tamien, and Spartan Keyes neighborhoods be kept in the same district. After discussion, Commissioner Barragan agreed to table her recommendation.

The Commission unanimously approved to advance the Commission Map (Map D4) to City Council for their consideration. (11-0-0)

Action: Upon motion by Commissioner Fadem and seconded by Commissioner Barragan, the Commission moved to advance the Community Map 5.0 to City Council for their consideration. (9-2-0; Noes: Cardenas, Wright) Commissioner Wright stated her desire to submit only one map to the City Council. Vice Chair Cardenas stated that the Commission should filter out some maps to reduce the workload for City Council.

Action: Upon motion by Commissioner Martinez and seconded by Commissioner Bruns, the Commission moved to advance the Unity Map (revised 11/14/2021) to City Council for their consideration. (6-5-0; Noes: Alvarez, Barragan, Ditlevsen, Fadem, Wright)

Action: Upon motion by Commissioner Barragan and seconded by Commissioner Alvarez, the Commission moved to recommend that the Guadalupe Washington, Goodyear Mastic, Tamien, and Spartan Keyes neighborhoods be kept in the same district in all maps recommended to City Council. (9-2-0; Noes: Ditlevsen, Cardenas)

b. Direct Redistricting Commission Chairs to Approve Meeting Minutes

Action: Upon motion by Commissioner Bruns and seconded by Commissioner Fadem, the Commission unanimously moved to direct the Redistricting Commission Chairs to approve meeting minutes. (11-0-0)

Public Comment: Blair Beekman expressed hope that the process will continue with City Council.

III. Adjournment

The Commission adjourned at 9:26 p.m.

Megan Roche

Email: megan.roche@sanjoseca.gov

Prepared by:
Megan Roche, Deputy City Clerk

Fred Buza

Email: [REDACTED]

Fred Buza
Chair, Redistricting Commission